

Parochial Church Council for the Parish of  
St David with St Michael and All Angels Exeter

Minutes of the PCC and Section 11 meetings for the parish of St David with St Michael and All Angels Exeter held on Thursday, 21 March 2024 at St Michael's church.

**Present:** Chair- Dave Allin (DA), Sue Wilson (SW), Paula Lewis (PL), Richard Parker (RP), Sarah Black (SB), Stephanie Hills (SH), Roger Beer (RB), Barbara Allin (BA), Matthew Glover (MG), Glynis Harflett (GH), Alice Francis (AF), Charlotte Townsend (CT), Robert Mitchell (RM), Hilary Todd (HT), Jonathan Johns (JJ), Ash Leighton Plom (ALP)

	<b>Apologies for absence</b> Laura Casimir, Maggie Draper, Natasha Holdsworth and Clive Wilson	<b>Action by:</b>
	<b>Conflict of Interests</b> Matthew Glover stated that he lives next door to St Michaels and is on the Residents' Committee.	
	<b>Confidentiality:</b> No items	
	<b>Minutes of the PCC meeting on January 25 2024:</b> Approval proposed by AF, Seconded by GH and approved. To note for the record: Papers and meeting notes from 19 February 2024, previously circulated. No decisions were taken at this meeting.	
	<b>Matters arising from the minutes:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Website update- RM reported that this has been done for St Michael's and is in hand for St David's. St David's website has been transferred to a new provider which has solved the warning issues about security certificates.</li> <li>• Fever concerts – The current contract makes us partially responsible for running the events. Our insurers support us letting the building, not running events for different organisations. JJ to sort this out with Fever</li> </ul>	JJ
	<b>Resolutions concerning the future of St Michael's</b> (previously circulated and attached) As these issues had been fully discussed at previous meetings Dave Allin proposed voting on the attached motions. Proposer Dave Allin, Seconded Glynis Harflett (for all these motions). <b>Motion 1:</b> Preservation of the status quo or change? Richard Parker objected to the motion saying the PCC should not be doing this in an interregnum, it made the parish less attractive , deterring younger applicants. No-one wants to come to a parish and close a church. It is not normal to change without an incumbent or Bishop in situ. there has been no discussion with St Michaels congregation, Dave Allin said there had been discussion and reflection over a number of years. The Bishop of Crediton was in post. The Archdeacon and Registrar have been involved and all due diligence followed. This does not stop Anglo Catholic worship. The Churchwardens said the Archdeacon was fully aware. J Johns said St Michael's will remain a church. Hilary Todd spoke for the Churchwardens who were elected just 11 months ago and had had a vertical learning curve with most of their time devoted to	DA

	<p>this issue. She asked for support from the PCC so they could work for the best for the whole parish to move forward with a strategy for finances, worship, hearts and minds. (see addendum for full statement)  <b>VOTE A- status quo - 1, B- make changes - 11 , Abstain - 2</b></p> <p><b>Motion 2 To change the pattern of worship at St Michaels to either:</b>  <b>Option A - services only on major Festival occasions</b>  <b>Option B - services at St M on major Festival Occasions plus Anglo Catholic services at St Davids with no incense.</b>  <b>Option C - Regular services at St M suspended, additional Anglo Catholic services at St Davids with no incense.</b></p> <p>St M would still be available for weddings and funerals.  <b>VOTE A- 0, B - 7, C- 6            Option B is adopted</b></p> <p><b>Motion 3 - Exploration of options for the church building</b>  The PCC authorises the wardens to contact the Diocese and other parties to explore the options available for social housing.  <b>VOTE for - 13 ,against - 1 , abstain - 2</b></p> <p><b>Motion 4 - examination of pathways</b>  The PCC authorises the Church Wardens to request the Archdeacon to investigate the process involved with possible changes.  <b>VOTE for - 11, against - 1, abstain – 2</b></p> <p>There was discussion of Barbara Allin’s request for a timeline for action for the resolutions passed, with the churchwardens insisting the discussions necessary with both congregations should be done carefully, reporting to the PCC. The PCC was clear it wanted progress before the appointment of a new incumbent. The churchwardens asked for constructive engagement from all concerned.</p>	RM/HT
	<p><b>Removal of Rood at St Michael’s – Consideration of the following Resolution:</b>  The PCC resolves that the Fr Owen Anwyl Memorial Rood should be returned from St Michael's to The Church of St Peter and the Holy Apostles, Wyndham Square, Plymouth (subject to St Peter's formally confirming their wish to receive it and accepting responsibility for transport costs). The PCC authorises the wardens to apply for the necessary approvals to achieve this. In the event of failure to agree return the PCC authorises the wardens to seek other routes for disposal.  Poposed Jonanathan Johns, Seconded Barbara Allin  <b>VOTE for -14, against - 1, abstain- 0</b></p>	RM/HT
	END OF FIRST PART OF PCC MEETING	
<b>SECTION 11 MEETING OF THE PCC Chair Dave Allin</b>		
i)	<p><b>Consideration of the following resolutions:</b>  The PCC resolves to approve the Parish profile version 9 (attached)  Hilary Todd asked for any short amendments to be given to her. Paula Lewis said there had only been one wedding at St M’s in the last year. Glynis Harflett and Ash Leighton Plum congratulated all who had put the parish profile together, especially H Todd and M Draper. It was agreed that we could ask for a keen interest in/ support for music, not ability as that would be</p>	

	<p>discriminatory. The Archdeacon's foreword was still awaited and HT undertook to circulate the revised parish profile to include that and the amendments once received.</p> <p>Proposal to adopt the parish profile. Proposed Ash Leighton Plum, Seconded Sue Wilson</p> <p><b>VOTE for 15, against 0, abstain - 1</b></p> <p>The PCC resolves to approve the advertisement (attached)</p> <p>Proposed Ash Leighton Plum, Seconded Sue Wilson</p> <p><b>VOTE for 15, against 1. abstain 0</b></p> <p>{AF left the meeting}</p>	HT
ii)	<p><b>Completion of Form 34: Appointment of Parish Representatives:</b></p> <p><b>Consideration of the following resolutions:</b></p> <p>The PCC resolves to appoint the Churchwardens as representatives to be on the interview panel Proposed - Dave Allin , Seconded - Ash Leighton Plum</p> <p><b>VOTE for 15 , against - 0. abstain - 1</b> (the wardens recused themselves)</p> <p>The PCC considers the resolutions required for our Form 34: (attached)</p> <p>a) to request the presenting patron to consider advertising the vacancy</p> <p>b) not to request a meeting (under section 12 of the Measure) with the Bishop and the presenting patron or their representatives</p> <p>c) not to request a statement in writing from the Bishop describing in relation to the benefice the needs of the diocese and the wider interests of the church</p> <p>Proposed - Hilary Todd, Seconded- Charlotte Townsend</p> <p><b>VOTE for - 15, against - 0, abstain - 1</b></p> <p>HT to complete the form.</p>	HT
<p><b>END OF SECTION 11 MEETING AND, IF TIME PERMITS, RESUMPTION OF PCC MEETING</b> Chair - Dave Allin</p>		
	<p><b>Wardens' Report</b></p> <p>This had been circulated. There was nothing to add.</p>	
	<p><b>Consideration of the following Resolution re Eucharistic Assistants:</b></p> <p>This PCC, meeting on 21 March 2024 resolves that Pam Stanley (St D's) and Charles Cowper (St M's) commended by the Churchwardens should be authorised to assist with the distribution of the Holy Communion within Public Worship in accordance with the Administration of Communion Regulations 2015 for a period of 3 years.</p> <p>Proposed Ash Leighton Plum, Seconded Glynis Harflett</p> <p><b>VOTE for- unanimous</b></p> <p>HT to complete the spreadsheet and forward it to the Archdeacon.</p>	HT
	<p><b>Standing Items:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Finance Report – No report to this PCC as preparation of year end accounts is in progress.</li> <li>• ST M Cash balance =£11,000. An energy bill was due for payment, so the PCC was asked to approve the request to realise £15,000 of Valpy French investments to ensure the working capital funds did not fall below £10,000, as agreed in September 2023, and to restore the cash balance. The PCC agreed to this proposal.</li> <li>• Fabric Reports - none from either church</li> <li>• Safeguarding Training event feedback - Charlotte Townsend reported a very useful meeting last week. Everyone needs to update their training.</li> </ul>	JJ

	there will be a full report for next PCC meeting	All/CT
1.	<p><b>Report of Miscellaneous Expenditure agreed by Standing Committee:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• New key lock box: £18 - bought today</li> <li>• Carpet cleaning in both churches: £207</li> <li>• Boiler repairs: £1000</li> <li>• Carbon Monoxide sensor: £27-bought today for St D, Jonathan Johns suggested there needs to be one for St M. Dave Allin said Standing Committee will check this.</li> <li>• Twiddle locks and fire signs: expected costs circa £100</li> </ul>	HT  DA
11.	<p><b>Plans for APCM and time line:</b></p> <p>Formal Notice of meeting to be displayed on 7<sup>th</sup>, 14 and 21<sup>st</sup> April in both churches</p> <p>2 PCC vacancies for representatives for St D's – nominations forms available at back of church and to be returned to Secretary or churchwarden by 14<sup>th</sup> April Clive and Sue Wilson wish to step back from Deanery Synod.</p> <p>Display of accounts one week before meeting</p> <p>Requests being sent to all contributors to Activities report – reports to be returned by Easter Tuesday ( 2<sup>nd</sup> April) to Maggie Draper</p> <p>Papers to be circulated on 14<sup>th</sup> April to everyone on email list</p> <p>Trustee forms to be completed by PCC members at APCM with agreement to undertake Safeguarding training and any necessary DBS checks</p>	All to note
12.	<p><b>Any Other Business:</b></p> <p>None was received before the meeting started</p> <p>Just before the first vote Barrie Mather entered the room and presented a letter and asked to address the meeting He was refused by the Chair who said he would circulate the paperwork but could not address it at this meeting as it had not been received in time.</p>	To be advised
13.	<b>Date and Time of Next meeting. Thursday 11th April 7.30pm, St David's</b>	All to note

The meeting closed with prayer.

## **Addendum 1**

11 months ago, the APCM voted Robert and myself in as CWs – both complete novices coming into post during an interregnum.

Since then the learning has not been so much a curve as a vertical line. And huge amounts of our time and energy have been spent on ‘what to do with St Mike’s?’

We are all of us trustees of the charity which looks after the parish of St David’s with St Michael’s. We all have to have a care for everyone associated with both churches.

For me the situation is crystallising into 3 linked issues because both churches have similar issues, some more pressing than others. The background is that:

- Both have aging congregations; in both, people who have served in various capacities, sometimes for decades, are finding their energy levels flagging and having to pull back.
- Finance is an issue in both, at St Mike’s more pressingly than at St David’s but still an issue.

So for me, 3 issues:

- St David’s – needs more of Robert and my time than it’s had
- St Michael’s – how to continue Anglo-Catholic worship in the parish with such diminished resources?
- What to do with the building?

Like it or not, they are separate issues.

Whatever decisions are made this evening will affect all of us in both churches and we will need to work together to come up with ways forward. That work may throw up solutions that haven’t yet been thought of. We had a vision day last September but no working groups have yet looked at taking the ideas forward even from that.

There is no timeframe on the resolutions, so I would ask that the churchwardens are tasked with coming up with a strategy to go forward, working with both congregations. With hindsight, always a wonderful thing, we should have started with the discussions, and the suggestion about the possible use of the building at St Michael’s should have been handled much more sensitively than it has been.

This is not just about finances. It is also about hearts and minds and doing the right things for all concerned. Whatever mistakes have been made in getting to this point, we need your buy-in to finding a workable way forward and hope you will support that.

Hilary Todd  
(Churchwarden)